

EDITOR

Joel Sobel
Department of Economics
University of California, San Diego
USA
jsobel@econometricsociety.org

CO-EDITORS

Barton L. Lipman
Department of Economics
Boston University
USA
blipman@econometricsociety.org

Alessandro Lizzeri
Department of Economics
New York University
USA
alizzeri@econometricsociety.org

Ulrich K. Müller
Department of Economics
Princeton University
USA
umuller@econometricsociety.org

Aviv Nevo
Department of Economics and
Wharton School
University of Pennsylvania
USA
anevo@econometricsociety.org

Giovanni L. Violante
Department of Economics
Princeton University
USA
gviolante@econometricsociety.org

Fabrizio Zilibotti
Department of Economics
Yale University
USA
zilibotti@econometricsociety.org

MANAGING EDITOR

Geri Mattson
Mattson Publishing Services
Baltimore, MD 21221 USA
mattsonpublishingservices@comcast.net

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Alberto Abadie
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, USA
Jaap Abbring
Tilburg University, Netherlands
Treb Allen
Dartmouth College, USA
Manuel Amador
Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis, USA
Andres Aradillas-Lopez
Penn State University, USA
Francis Bloch
Université Paris 1, France
Paris School of Economics, France
Nicholas Bloom
Stanford University, USA
Eric Budish
University of Chicago, USA
Xiaohong Chen
Yale University, USA
Ernesto Dal Bó
University of California, Berkeley, USA
Pascaline Dupas
Stanford University, USA
Federico Echenique
California Institute of Technology, USA
Jesús Fernández-Villaverde
University of Pennsylvania, USA
Guillaume Fréchet
New York University, USA
Amanda Friedenberg
University of Arizona, USA
Xavier Gabaix
Harvard University, USA
Philip Haile
Yale University, USA
Marina Halac
Yale University, USA
Keisuke Hirano
Pennsylvania State University, USA
ISER, Japan
Stefan Hoderlein
Boston College, USA
Michael Jansson
University of California, Berkeley, USA
Patrick Kline
University of California, Berkeley, USA
Felix Kubler
University of Zurich, Switzerland
Jia Li
Duke University, USA
Hanno Lustig
Stanford University, USA
Massimo Marinacci
Università Bocconi, Italy
Andrew McLennan
University of Queensland, Australia
Francesca Molinari
Cornell University, USA
Sujoy Mukherji
Queen Mary University of London, UK
Serena Ng
Columbia University, USA
Andriy Norets
Brown University, USA
Wojciech Olszewski
Northwestern University, USA
Elias Papanicolaou
London Business School, UK
Stephen Redding
Princeton University, USA
Marzena Rostek
University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA
Andres Santos
University of California, Los Angeles, USA
Todd Sarver
Duke University, USA
Ilya R. Segal
Stanford University, USA
Azeem M. Shaikh
University of Chicago, USA
Neil Shephard
Harvard University, USA
Zheng Michael Song
The Chinese University of Hong Kong
Hong Kong
Tayfun Sönmez
Boston College, USA
Christopher Taber
University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA
Viktor Todorov
Northwestern University, USA
Aleh Tsyvinski
Yale University, USA
Nicolas Vieille
HEC Paris, France
Rakesh Vohra
University of Pennsylvania, USA
Pierre-Olivier Weill
University of California, Los Angeles, USA
Bas J.M. Werker
Tilburg University, Netherlands
Leont Yariv
Princeton University, USA

ECONOMETRICA

PUBLISHED BY THE ECONOMETRIC SOCIETY

An International Society for the Advancement of Economic

Theory in its Relation to Statistics and Mathematics

www.econometricsociety.org

October 22, 2018

Alexis Akira Toda
Department of Economics
University of California San Diego
La Jolla, CA 92093-0508

Dear Alexix:

Thank you for submitting MS# 16742 “An Impossibility Theorem for Wealth in Heterogeneous-agent Models with Limited Heterogeneity” joint with John Stachurski to *Econometrica*.

I am sorry to report that, after reading your manuscript, we have come to the conclusion that we will be unable to publish it. Let me add that this very rapid decision does not imply a more severe criticism than an ordinary rejection after three or four months. Moreover, the fact that we are not providing detailed reports does not mean that we did not consider the paper seriously.

It simply indicates that the paper was read personally by a member of our editorial board, rather than by outside referees, who was able to consider the paper and reach a decision soon after the paper arrived.

In a nutshell, it has become widely understood, both theoretically and empirically, that in the standard Aiyagari model with stochastic earnings the tail of wealth and earnings will coincide. In their JEL article (section 3.1.1), Benhabib and Bisin do not assume your equation (1.1) holds with equality. They have an inequality (because of the term $\chi_t > 0$) and discuss its microfoundations. In other earlier papers they also have the accumulation equation with $\chi_t > 0$ microfounded, e.g. their ECMA (2011) and AER (Benhabib-Bisin-Luo, forthcoming).

Their proofs follow directly from now standard theorem of Kesten and Grey, and for the Aiyagari model which is only asymptotically linear in its consumption function with CRRA preferences, from generalizations of the Kesten theorems by Mirek, cited for example in the JET article. Tail results are asymptotic, so asymptotic linearity is enough to get the results.

Your result in section 4.2 is also known. Heterogeneity in discount factors (without randomness) has been used by Carroll et al. (QE, 2014) to get the tail of wealth fatter than that of income, as the patient agents accumulate faster, and they also had to introduce Poisson death rates to prevent the distribution from exploding. It is also well known that birth and death models can produce Pareto tails, with homogeneous or heterogeneous discounting. There are many such early (e.g., Wold and Whittle) and more recent models of this kind in the literature.

Overall, yours is an elegant paper but there is not enough novelty, I am afraid, to clear the high bar for this journal. Your proofs are new and there is value in having alternative proofs, given the importance of the topic in economics. A journal specialized in theory or in macroeconomics should be interested in publishing these new proofs.

Again, I am sorry to convey the bad news. I thank you for giving us the opportunity to consider your work and wish you luck in finding an alternate outlet for your paper.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Gianluca Violante". The signature is written in a cursive style with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Gianluca Violante

Co-Editor, *Econometrica*